

1 CURTIS A. GRAHAM (BAR NO. 89755)
2 curtis.graham@ffslaw.com
3 WILLIAM E. ADAMS (BAR NO. 153330)
4 william.adams@ffslaw.com
5 JEFFREY S. GOODFRIED (BAR NO. 253804)
6 jeffrey.goodfried@ffslaw.com
7 CAROL CHOW (BAR NO. 169299)
8 carol.chow@ffslaw.com
9 FREEMAN, FREEMAN & SMILEY, LLP
10 1888 Century Park East, Suite 1500
11 Los Angeles, California 90067
12 Telephone: (310) 255-6100
13 Facsimile: (310) 255-6200

14 Attorneys for Plaintiffs

15 **UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT**
16 **CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA**

17 SUSAN GRADMAN AND WAYNE
18 GRADMAN, INDIVIDUALLY AND
19 AS CO-TRUSTEES OF THE FISKE
20 LIVING TRUST OF JUNE 14, 1967,
21 AS AMENDED AND RESTATED ON
22 JANUARY 29, 2015,

23 Plaintiffs,

24 vs.

25 DEBRA L. DUGGAN aka DEBRA
26 GREGG, an individual; et al.,

27 Defendants.

28 Case No. 2:23-cv-02373-JFW-AGR

29 Honorable John F. Walter

30 **STIPULATED PROTECTIVE
31 ORDER**

32 **NOTE CHANGES MADE BY COURT**

33 **FREEMAN, FREEMAN & SMILEY, LLP**
34 **1888 CENTURY PARK EAST, SUITE 1500**
35 **LOS ANGELES, CALIFORNIA 90067**
36 **(310) 255-6100**

1 A. PURPOSES AND LIMITATIONS

2 Discovery in this action is likely to involve production of confidential, proprietary, or
3 private information for which special protection from public disclosure and from use for any
4 purpose other than prosecuting this litigation may be warranted. Accordingly, the parties hereby
5 stipulate to and petition the Court to enter the following Stipulated Protective Order. The parties
6 acknowledge that this Order does not confer blanket protections on all disclosures or responses to
7 discovery and that the protection it affords from public disclosure and use extends only to the
8 limited information or items that are entitled to confidential treatment under the applicable legal
9 principles. The parties further acknowledge, as set forth in Section 12.2, below, that this Stipulated
10 Protective Order does not entitle them to file confidential information under seal; Civil Local
11 Rule 79-5 sets forth the procedures that must be followed and the standards that will be applied
12 when a party seeks permission from the court to file material under seal.

13 B. GOOD CAUSE STATEMENT

14 This action is likely to involve trade secrets, customer and pricing lists and other valuable
15 research, development, commercial, financial, technical and/or proprietary information for which
16 special protection from public disclosure and from use for any purpose other than prosecution of
17 this action is warranted. Such confidential and proprietary materials and information consist of,
18 among other things, confidential business or financial information, information regarding
19 confidential business practices, or other confidential research, development, or commercial
20 information (including information implicating privacy rights of third parties), information
21 otherwise generally unavailable to the public, or which may be privileged or otherwise protected
22 from disclosure under state or federal statutes, court rules, case decisions, or common law.
23 Accordingly, to expedite the flow of information, to facilitate the prompt resolution of disputes
24 over confidentiality of discovery materials, to adequately protect information the parties are
25 entitled to keep confidential, to ensure that the parties are permitted reasonable necessary uses of
26 such material in preparation for and in the conduct of trial, to address their handling at the end of
27 the litigation, and serve the ends of justice, a protective order for such information is justified in
28 this matter. It is the intent of the parties that information will not be designated as confidential for

1 tactical reasons and that nothing be so designated without a good faith belief that it has been
 2 maintained in a confidential, non-public manner, and there is good cause why it should not be part
 3 of the public record of this case.

4 2. DEFINITIONS

5 2.1 Action: This pending federal law suit.

6 2.2 Challenging Party: A Party or Non-Party that challenges the designation of
 7 information or items under this Order.

8 2.3 “CONFIDENTIAL”: Information (regardless of how it is generated, stored
 9 or maintained) or tangible things that qualify for protection under Federal Rule of Civil
 10 Procedure 26(c), and as specified above in the Good Cause Statement. “CONFIDENTIAL”
 11 information excludes any information or tangible things: (a) that have previously been disclosed,
 12 published or made a part of any public record; (b) that were in the possession of the Disclosing
 13 Party prior to the commencement of the Action; or (c) that were acquired by the Disclosing Party
 14 from any third parties not bound by any applicable protective orders.

15 2.4 Counsel: Outside Counsel of Record and House Counsel (as well as their
 16 support staff).

17 2.5 Designating Party: A Party or Non-Party that designates information or
 18 items that it produces in disclosures or in responses to discovery as “CONFIDENTIAL.”

19 2.6 Disclosure or Discovery Material: All items or information, regardless of
 20 the medium or manner in which it is generated, stored, or maintained (including, among other
 21 things, testimony, transcripts, and tangible things), that are produced or generated in disclosures or
 22 responses to discovery in this matter.

23 2.7 Expert: A person with specialized knowledge or experience in a matter
 24 pertinent to the litigation who has been retained by a Party or its counsel to serve as an expert
 25 witness or as a consultant in this Action.

26 2.8 House Counsel: Attorneys who are employees of a party to this Action.
 27 House Counsel does not include Outside Counsel of Record or any other outside counsel.

28 2.9 Non-Party: Any natural person, partnership, corporation, association, or

1 other legal entity not named as a Party to this action.

2 2.10 Outside Counsel of Record: Attorneys who are not employees of a party to
3 this Action but are retained to represent or advise a party to this Action and have appeared in this
4 Action on behalf of that party or are affiliated with a law firm which has appeared on behalf of
5 that party, and includes support staff.

6 2.11 Party: Any party to this Action, including all of its officers, directors,
7 employees, consultants, retained experts, and Outside Counsel of Record (and their support staffs).

8 2.12 Producing Party: A Party or Non-Party that produces Disclosure or
9 Discovery Material in this Action.

10 2.13 Professional Vendors: Persons or entities that provide litigation support
11 services (e.g., photocopying, videotaping, translating, preparing exhibits or demonstrations, and
12 organizing, storing, or retrieving data in any form or medium) and their employees and
13 subcontractors.

14 2.14 Protected Material: Any Disclosure or Discovery Material that is
15 designated as “CONFIDENTIAL.”

16 2.15 Receiving Party: A Party that receives Disclosure or Discovery Material
17 from a Producing Party.

18 3. SCOPE

19 The protections conferred by this Stipulation and Order cover not only Protected Material
20 (as defined above), but also (1) any information copied or extracted from Protected Material;
21 (2) all copies, excerpts, summaries, or compilations of Protected Material; and (3) any testimony,
22 conversations, or presentations by Parties or their Counsel that might reveal Protected Material.

23 Any use of Protected Material at trial shall be governed by the orders of the trial judge.
24 This Order does not govern the use of Protected Material at trial.

25 4. DURATION

26 Once a case proceeds to trial, all of the information that was designated as confidential or
27 maintained pursuant to this protective order becomes public and will be presumptively available to
28 all members of the public, including the press, unless compelling reasons supported by specific

1 factual findings to proceed otherwise are made to the trial judge in advance of the trial. *See*
 2 *Kamakana v. City and County of Honolulu*, 447 F.3d 1172, 1180-81 (9th Cir. 2006) (distinguishing
 3 “good cause” showing for sealing documents produced in discovery from “compelling reasons”
 4 standard when merits-related documents are part of court record). Accordingly, the terms of this
 5 protective order do not extend beyond the commencement of the trial.

6 5. DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL

7 5.1 Exercise of Restraint and Care in Designating Material for Protection.

8 Each Party or Non-Party that designates information or items for protection under this
 9 Order must take care to limit any such designation to specific material that qualifies under the
 10 appropriate standards. The Designating Party must designate for protection only those parts of
 11 material, documents, items, or oral or written communications that qualify so that other portions of
 12 the material, documents, items, or communications for which protection is not warranted are not
 13 swept unjustifiably within the ambit of this Order.

14 Mass, indiscriminate, or routinized designations are prohibited. Designations that are
 15 shown to be clearly unjustified or that have been made for an improper purpose (e.g., to
 16 unnecessarily encumber the case development process or to impose unnecessary expenses and
 17 burdens on other parties) may expose the Designating Party to sanctions.

18 If it comes to a Designating Party’s attention that information or items that it designated
 19 for protection do not qualify for protection, that Designating Party must promptly notify all other
 20 Parties that it is withdrawing the inapplicable designation.

21 5.2 Manner and Timing of Designations.

22 Except as otherwise provided in this Order (*see, e.g.*, second paragraph of subparagraph (a)
 23 below), or as otherwise stipulated or ordered, Disclosure or Discovery Material that qualifies for
 24 protection under this Order must be clearly so designated before the material is disclosed or
 25 produced.

26 Designation in conformity with this Order requires:

27 (a) for information in documentary form (e.g., paper or electronic documents, but
 28 excluding transcripts of depositions or other pretrial or trial proceedings), that the Producing Party

1 affix at a minimum, the legend “CONFIDENTIAL” (hereinafter “CONFIDENTIAL legend”), to
 2 each page that contains protected material. If only a portion or portions of the material on a page
 3 qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also must clearly identify the protected portion(s)
 4 (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the margins).

5 A Party or Non-Party that makes original documents available for inspection need not
 6 designate them for protection until after the inspecting Party has indicated which documents it
 7 would like copied and produced. During the inspection and before the designation, all of the
 8 material made available for inspection shall be deemed “CONFIDENTIAL.” After the inspecting
 9 Party has identified the documents it wants copied and produced, the Producing Party must
 10 determine which documents, or portions thereof, qualify for protection under this Order. Then,
 11 before producing the specified documents, the Producing Party must affix the “CONFIDENTIAL
 12 legend” to each page that contains Protected Material. If only a portion or portions of the material
 13 on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also must clearly identify the protected
 14 portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the margins).

15 (b) for testimony given in depositions that the Designating Party identify the
 16 Disclosure or Discovery Material on the record, before the close of the deposition all protected
 17 testimony.

18 (c) for information produced in some form other than documentary and for any other
 19 tangible items, that the Producing Party affix in a prominent place on the exterior of the container
 20 or containers in which the information is stored the legend “CONFIDENTIAL.” If only a portion
 21 or portions of the information warrants protection, the Producing Party, to the extent practicable,
 22 shall identify the protected portion(s).

23 5.3 Inadvertent Failures to Designate.

24 If timely corrected, an inadvertent failure to designate qualified information or items does
 25 not, standing alone, waive the Designating Party’s right to secure protection under this Order for
 26 such material. Upon timely correction of a designation, the Receiving Party must make reasonable
 27 efforts to assure that the material is treated in accordance with the provisions of this Order.

28 6. CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS

1 6.1 Timing of Challenges.

2 Any Party or Non-Party may challenge a designation of confidentiality at any time that is
 3 consistent with the Court's Scheduling Order.

4 6.2 Meet and Confer.

5 The Challenging Party shall initiate the dispute resolution process under Local Rule 37.1 *et*
 6 *seq.*

7 The burden of persuasion in any such challenge proceeding shall be on the Designating
 8 Party. Frivolous challenges, and those made for an improper purpose (*e.g.*, to harass or impose
 9 unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) may expose the Challenging Party to
 10 sanctions. Unless the Designating Party has waived or withdrawn the confidentiality designation,
 11 all parties shall continue to afford the material in question the level of protection to which it is
 12 entitled under the Producing Party's designation until the Court rules on the challenge.

13 7. ACCESS TO AND USE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL14 7.1 Basic Principles.

15 A Receiving Party may use Protected Material that is disclosed or produced by another
 16 Party or by a Non-Party in connection with this Action only for prosecuting, defending, or
 17 attempting to settle this Action. Such Protected Material may be disclosed only to the categories of
 18 persons and under the conditions described in this Order. When the Action has been terminated, a
 19 Receiving Party must comply with the provisions of Section 13 below (FINAL DISPOSITION).

20 Protected Material must be stored and maintained by a Receiving Party at a location and in
 21 a secure manner that ensures that access is limited to the persons authorized under this Order.

22 7.2 Disclosure of "CONFIDENTIAL" Information or Items.

23 Unless otherwise ordered by the court or permitted in writing by the Designating Party, a
 24 Receiving Party may disclose any information or item designated "CONFIDENTIAL" only to:

25 (a) the Receiving Party's Outside Counsel of Record in this Action, as well as
 26 employees of said Outside Counsel of Record to whom it is reasonably necessary to disclose the
 27 information for this Action;

28 (b) the officers, directors, and employees (including House Counsel) of the Receiving

1 Party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action;

2 (c) Experts (as defined in this Order) of the Receiving Party to whom disclosure is
 3 reasonably necessary for this Action and who have signed the "Acknowledgment and Agreement
 4 to Be Bound" (Exhibit A);

5 (d) the court and its personnel;

6 (e) court reporters and their staff;

7 (f) professional jury or trial consultants, mock jurors, and Professional Vendors to
 8 whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action and who have signed the
 9 "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" (Exhibit A);

10 (g) the author or recipient of a document containing the information or a custodian or
 11 other person who otherwise possessed or knew the information;

12 (h) during their depositions, witnesses ,and attorneys for witnesses, in the Action to
 13 whom disclosure is reasonably necessary provided: (1) the deposing party requests that the witness
 14 sign the form attached as Exhibit 1 hereto; and (2) they will not be permitted to keep any
 15 confidential information unless they sign the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound"
 16 (Exhibit A), unless otherwise agreed by the Designating Party or ordered by the court. Pages of
 17 transcribed deposition testimony or exhibits to depositions that reveal Protected Material may be
 18 separately bound by the court reporter and may not be disclosed to anyone except as permitted
 19 under this Stipulated Protective Order; and

20 (i) any mediator or settlement officer, and their supporting personnel, mutually agreed
 21 upon by any of the parties engaged in settlement discussions.

22 8. **PROTECTED MATERIAL SUBPOENAED OR ORDERED PRODUCED IN**
 23 **OTHER LITIGATION**

24 If a Party is served with a subpoena or a court order issued in other litigation that compels
 25 disclosure of any information or items designated in this Action as "CONFIDENTIAL," that Party
 26 must:

27 (a) promptly notify in writing the Designating Party. Such notification shall include a
 28 copy of the subpoena or court order;

5 (c) cooperate with respect to all reasonable procedures sought to be pursued by the
6 Designating Party whose Protected Material may be affected.

7 If the Designating Party timely seeks a protective order, the Party served with the subpoena
8 or court order shall not produce any information designated in this action as “CONFIDENTIAL”
9 before a determination by the court from which the subpoena or order issued, unless the Party has
10 obtained the Designating Party’s permission. The Designating Party shall bear the burden and
11 expense of seeking protection in that court of its confidential material and nothing in these
12 provisions should be construed as authorizing or encouraging a Receiving Party in this Action to
13 disobey a lawful directive from another court.

14 9. A NON-PARTY'S PROTECTED MATERIAL SOUGHT TO BE PRODUCED IN
15 THIS LITIGATION

16 (a) The terms of this Order are applicable to information produced by a Non-Party in
17 this Action and designated as “CONFIDENTIAL.” Such information produced by Non-Parties in
18 connection with this litigation is protected by the remedies and relief provided by this Order.
19 Nothing in these provisions should be construed as prohibiting a Non-Party from seeking
20 additional protections.

21 (b) In the event that a Party is required, by a valid discovery request, to produce a Non-
22 Party's confidential information in its possession, and the Party is subject to an agreement with the
23 Non-Party not to produce the Non-Party's confidential information, then the Party shall:

24 (1) promptly notify in writing the Requesting Party and the Non-Party that
25 some or all of the information requested is subject to a confidentiality
26 agreement with a Non-Party;

27 (2) promptly provide the Non-Party with a copy of the Stipulated Protective
28 Order in this Action, the relevant discovery request(s), and a reasonably

specific description of the information requested; and

(3) make the information requested available for inspection by the Non-Party, if requested.

4 (c) If the Non-Party fails to seek a protective order from this court within 14 days of
5 receiving the notice and accompanying information, the Receiving Party may produce the Non-
6 Party's confidential information responsive to the discovery request. If the Non-Party timely seeks
7 a protective order, the Receiving Party shall not produce any information in its possession or
8 control that is subject to the confidentiality agreement with the Non-Party before a determination
9 by the court. Absent a court order to the contrary, the Non-Party shall bear the burden and expense
10 of seeking protection in this court of its Protected Material.

10. UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

If a Receiving Party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has disclosed Protected Material to any person or in any circumstance not authorized under this Stipulated Protective Order, the Receiving Party must immediately (a) notify in writing the Designating Party of the unauthorized disclosures, (b) use its best efforts to retrieve all unauthorized copies of the Protected Material, (c) inform the person or persons to whom unauthorized disclosures were made of all the terms of this Order, and (d) request such person or persons to execute the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" that is attached hereto as Exhibit A.

19 11. INADVERTENT PRODUCTION OF PRIVILEGED OR OTHERWISE
20 PROTECTED MATERIAL

21 When a Producing Party gives notice to Receiving Parties that certain inadvertently
22 produced material is subject to a claim of privilege or other protection, the obligations of the
23 Receiving Parties are those set forth in Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(b)(5)(B). This
24 provision is not intended to modify whatever procedure may be established in an e-discovery order
25 that provides for production without prior privilege review. Pursuant to Federal Rule of Evidence
26 502(d) and (e), insofar as the parties reach an agreement on the effect of disclosure of a
27 communication or information covered by the attorney-client privilege or work product protection,
28 the parties may incorporate their agreement in the stipulated protective order submitted to the

1 court.

2 12. MISCELLANEOUS

3 Right to Further Relief. Nothing in this Order abridges the right of any person to seek its
4 modification by the Court in the future.

5 12.1 Right to Assert Other Objections. By stipulating to the entry of this
6 Protective Order no Party waives any right it otherwise would have to object to disclosing or
7 producing any information or item on any ground not addressed in this Stipulated Protective
8 Order. Similarly, no Party waives any right to object on any ground to use in evidence of any of
9 the material covered by this Protective Order.

10 12.2 Filing Protected Material. A Party that seeks to file under seal any Protected
11 Material must comply with Civil Local Rule 79-5. Protected Material may only be filed under seal
12 pursuant to a court order authorizing the sealing of the specific Protected Material at issue. ~~Unless~~
13 ~~otherwise ordered by the court or agreed to by the parties, the Designating Party must prepare the~~
14 ~~Application and declaration establishing good cause for filing its Protective Materials under seal~~
15 ~~with five (5) calendar days' of receiving notice from a Party that intends to file such Protective~~
16 ~~Materials with the Court.~~ If the Designating Party fails to timely provide the ~~Application and~~
17 declaration required by Local Rule 79-5 or if a Party's request to file Protected Material under seal
18 is denied by the court, then the Receiving Party may file the information in the public record
19 unless otherwise instructed by the court.

20 13. FINAL DISPOSITION

21 After the final disposition of this Action, as defined in paragraph 4, within 60 days of a
22 written request by the Designating Party, each Receiving Party must return all Protected Material
23 to the Producing Party or destroy such material. As used in this subdivision, "all Protected
24 Material" includes all copies, abstracts, compilations, summaries, and any other format
25 reproducing or capturing any of the Protected Material. Whether the Protected Material is returned
26 or destroyed, the Receiving Party must submit a written certification to the Producing Party (and,
27 if not the same person or entity, to the Designating Party) by the 60 day deadline that (1) identifies
28 (by category, where appropriate) all the Protected Material that was returned or destroyed and

1 (2)affirms that the Receiving Party has not retained any copies, abstracts, compilations, summaries
2 or any other format reproducing or capturing any of the Protected Material. Notwithstanding this
3 provision, Counsel are entitled to retain an archival copy of all pleadings, motion papers, trial,
4 deposition, and hearing transcripts, legal memoranda, correspondence, deposition and trial
5 exhibits, expert reports, attorney work product, and consultant and expert work product, even if
6 such materials contain Protected Material. Any such archival copies that contain or constitute
7 Protected Material remain subject to this Protective Order as set forth in Section 4 (DURATION).

8 14. Any violation of this Order may be punished by any and all appropriate measures
9 including, without limitation, contempt proceedings and/or monetary sanctions.

10 IT IS SO STIPULATED, THROUGH COUNSEL OF RECORD

11

12 DATED: June 26, 2023 FREEMAN, FREEMAN & SMILEY, LLP

13

14 By: /s/ William E. Adams
15 WILLIAM E. ADAMS
16 Attorneys for Plaintiffs

17

18 DATED: June 26, 2023 TUCKER ELLIS LLP

19

20 By: /s/ Marc R. Greenberg
21 MARC R. GREENBERG
22 Attorneys for Defendants

23

24

25

26

27

28

SIGNATURE ATTESTATION

Pursuant to Civil L.R. 5-4.3.4(a)(2)(i), the filer attests that all other signatories listed, and on whose behalf this filing is submitted, concur in the filing's content and have authorized the filing.

DATED: June 26, 2023 FREEMAN, FREEMAN & SMILEY, LLP

By: /s/ William E. Adams
WILLIAM E. ADAMS
Attorneys for Plaintiffs

FOR GOOD CAUSE SHOWN, IT IS SO ORDERED.

DATED: July 18, 2023

Alicia L. Rosenberg

Honorable Alicia G. Rosenberg
United States Magistrate Judge

1 EXHIBIT A

2 ACKNOWLEDGMENT AND AGREEMENT TO BE BOUND

3 I, _____ [print or type full name], of _____ [print or
4 type full address], declare under penalty of perjury that I have read in its entirety and understand
5 the Stipulated Protective Order that was issued by the United States District Court for the Central
6 District of California on [date] in the case of *Susan Gradman et al. v. Debra L. Duggan, et al.*
7 Case No. 2:23-cv-02373-JFW-AGR. I agree to comply with and to be bound by all the terms of
8 this Stipulated Protective Order and I understand and acknowledge that failure to so comply could
9 expose me to sanctions and punishment in the nature of contempt. I solemnly promise that I will
10 not disclose in any manner any information or item that is subject to this Stipulated Protective
11 Order to any person or entity except in strict compliance with the provisions of this Order.
12 I further agree to submit to the jurisdiction of the United States District Court for the Central
13 District of California for the purpose of enforcing the terms of this Stipulated Protective Order,
14 even if such enforcement proceedings occur after termination of this action. I hereby appoint
15 _____ [print or type full name] of

16 _____ [print or type full address and telephone number]
17 as my California agent for service of process in connection with this action or any proceedings
18 related to enforcement of this Stipulated Protective Order.

19 Date: _____

20 City and State where sworn and signed: _____

21 Printed name: _____

22 Signature: _____

23

24

25

26

27

28